

Third Party Monitoring Report of Joint Programme for Sustainable Charcoal Reduction and Alternative Livelihoods (PROSCAL) Project

(Q3 & Q4 - 2020)

**Submitted to
UNDP**

Table of Contents

Table of Contents	2
Executive summary	3
1.0 Introduction	6
1.1 Background on the project	6
1.2 Project Objectives & Outcomes	6
2.0 Methodology	7
2.1 Approach	7
2.2 Data collection	7
2.3 Data processing	7
2.4 Data quality	7
2.5 Field challenges	7
3.0 Findings	8
3.1 Federal Government of Somalia	8
3.2 Somaliland	8
3.3 Puntland State	9
3.4 Jubaland State	11
3.5 Hirshabelle State	11
3.6 Southwest State	12
4.0 Recommendations	13
5.0 Annexes	14

Executive summary

The table below shows key highlights of the findings of third party monitoring of the **Joint Programme for Sustainable Charcoal Reduction and Alternative Livelihoods (PROSCAL)** Project.

Ministry/State	Summary of Findings
Federal Government of Somalia Ministry of Livestock, Forest and Rangelands (MOLFR)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Directorate of Environment and Climate Change at the Office of the Prime Minister signed the LOA on November 17th 2020. Since November, the directorate of environment has successfully coordinated LPG distribution in Jubaland (Kismayo) and Southwest State (Baidoa) where a total of 600 units of LPGs were delivered in each of the two locations. Project team admitted that they are slightly behind schedule due to the late signing of the LOA. - No coordination meeting, briefings, workshops were conducted in the last 6 months of 2020.
Somaliland Ministry of Environment and Rural Development - MOERD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The PROSCAL project is in its third year of implementation in Somaliland – implemented for 6 months in 2018, 6 months in 2019, and 4 months in 2020. - In Somaliland, the PROSCAL has taken a different approach as compared to Puntland and Mogadishu where the LPG cylinders are distributed for free. In Somaliland, the LPG gas cylinders were offered at a very subsidized price of \$12 - the subsidy involves a 62.5 percent reduction on market price of 32 dollars to 12 dollars. - In 2020, the project planned to distribute 2,910 LPG gas cylinders Hargeisa, Borama, Burco, Berbera, Las’anod, and Erigavo - 400 for Borama, 900 for Hargeisa, 600 for Burco and 200 each for Berbera, Las’anod, and Erigavo. - Also included in the distribution in 2020 were three health facilities, namely Borama, Burco, and Las’anod Hospitals where the project team renovated their cooking stations and fitted with LPG gas cookers, and Thermal Solar Heaters to warm and boil water. - The distribution task was assigned to HASS Petroleum, one of the main distributors of LPG gas in Somaliland. The Ministry instructed HASS to include a disclaimer note indicating that the Ministry and UNDP are not responsible for any negligence on the part of consumer when handling the cylinders.
Puntland State Ministry of Environment, Agriculture and Climate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The ministry has received a consignment of LPG cylinders with cookers to support the vulnerable community members

Change	<p>in Qardho, Bosaso, Badhan, Baran, Xingalol, Dahar, Galkaio and Garowe districts. In addition, three (3) functional water-heating systems have been installed at the Orphanage college, Garowe general Hospital and Garowe main prison.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Public private partnership (PPP) dialogue on shifting of low-income families from charcoal/wood to alternative cooking energies with LPG companies, efficient cooking stove producers, energy consumers and MoEACC to discuss the shift of low-income families from charcoal / wood to clean energy was held. - The outcome of the dialogue forum was creating increased awareness on environmental degradation and loss of livelihoods due to charcoal trade. - Three (3) cooperatives were established through training of 12 IDPs representatives from 3 IDP camps. Following the trainings, the representatives were provided with equipment required to make the efficient cooking stoves.
Jubaland State Ministry of Environment & Tourism	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - For PROSCAL project, Jubaland’s ministry of environment and tourism did not sign any agreement or LOA with UNDP, but implementation of the project is spearheaded by the Ministry of Livestock, Forest and Rangelands (MOLFR) of the Federal Government of Somalia. - The Ministry of Livestock, Forest and Rangelands (MOLFR) of the FGS has successfully delivered 600 units LPG gas cylinders under the PROSCAL programme during Q3/Q4 2020 period. For these 2 quarters the ministry staff reported that no other activity or component was delivered at Jubaland State in as far as the PROSCAL project is concerned. - However, they furthered that the ministry of environment and tourism of Jubaland state officials attended the international conference of charcoal in Mogadishu on 7th and 8th may 2018 which was organized by the federal government of Somalia. - Kismayo Gas Company was awarded the contract of distributing the 600 gas cylinders and at the TPM visit 405 cylinders were distributed and distribution was on-going.
Hirshabelle State Ministry of Environment & Rural Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Implementation of the PROSCAL project in Hirshabelle State involves only two key activities: the distribution of 600 gas cookers 300 in Jowhar and 300 in Beledweyne and purchase and planting of 1000 trees in Jowhar town. The line ministry has not conducted any other activities in the last 6 months (July –December 2020).
Southwest State	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The minister for Environment and Wildlife Hon. Ali Issack

Ministry of Environment, Wildlife & Tourism	stated that the ministry has not done any concrete activities for PROSCAL project, save for the distribution of 600 LPG gas cylinders that were handed over to the ministry on 29-12-2020 in Baidoa. Ministry officials explained that the aim of the gas cylinders is to reduce charcoal trade and support alternative livelihoods and empower women who are on the charcoal business and to set up alternative energy businesses in liquefied petroleum and solar energy to minimise charcoal use, and build up opportunities to more alternative livelihoods.
--	--

1.0 Introduction

1.1 Background on the project

Somalia is among the world's most vulnerable countries to the impacts of climate change, which are to a large degree the result of poverty, environmental degradation, migration and conflict. More than 80% of Somalia's landmass is arid and semi-arid and experiences extreme weather conditions. Historically, drought has been an on-going issue for the country - five main factors cause environmental degradation, which further exasperates the frequency and consequences of drought. These include: population growth cost of rural colonization, deforestation, soil erosion, and climate change. As a result, most of the country has been experiencing a devastating drought for the past few years and consequences have been severe; for example, springs, which contribute 11% of groundwater, have lost as much as 90% of the water (Hussein, 2017). Furthermore, due to the relatively low degree of institutional resilience and absorptive capacities, there are not many policies or programmes to mitigate or adapt to these perennial droughts and address the impacts of climate change.

This Joint Programme is in response to the UN Security Council resolution 2036 (2012) that seeks international cooperation to ban illegal exports of Charcoal from Somalia. The programme envisages a comprehensive response strategy to support the Security Council's Resolution. In implementing its mandate, PROSCAL builds upon successful projects executed by UN agencies to support the ban and uses the UN Joint Programming modality to harmonize approaches and maximize synergies. Building on existing collaboration efforts of partner organisations and governments, the programme emphasizes joint work plans, monitoring and evaluation of activities, and offers a forum for policy harmonization between national governments on activities related to the charcoal trade ban in the region.

1.2 Project Objectives & Outcomes

The programme envisages a comprehensive response to support the Security Council resolution. The specific objectives of the programme are four: 1) Support government in Somalia as well as countries in the Horn of Africa and the region to produce pertinent legal instruments and strengthen enforcement mechanisms at national, regional and local levels; 2) Promote alternative sources of energy to reduce local charcoal consumption; 3) Provide alternative livelihoods to the Charcoal Value Chain Beneficiaries (CVCBs) involved in the charcoal production and trade; and, 4) Country wide reforestation and afforestation to regain the productive potential of the environmentally degraded lands.

2.0 Methodology

2.1 Approach

The third party monitoring was guided by the use of project indicator checklist approved provided and approved by UNDP. The monitoring targeted staff of the implementing departments across governance levels in the country. These include ministry officials at the FGS level, Somaliland, Puntland, Jubaland, Galmudug, Hirshabelle, and Southwest states. Overall, the TPM adopted key informant interviews during the monitoring process as well as observation to verify activities accomplished as at the TPM visit.

2.2 Data collection

The monitoring adopted the use of pre-designed questionnaires/checklists to gather relevant information related to the project under review. Geo-tagged photos were also collected where evidence was available. Trained TPM researchers administered the questionnaires during the data collection and summary notes were prepared from those interviews.

2.3 Data processing

After the data collection phase of the monitoring exercise, the team collated the raw data for analysis. Findings of the qualitative data, collected as transcripts from all interviews with project staffs were analyzed in detail to inform this report. Further, observation notes from the field were also used to complement the information collected.

2.4 Data quality

Field data were validated and triangulated to ensure quality. The rationale for triangulation was that the use of multiple methods and sources overcomes the weaknesses associated with using single methods and sources. Any inconsistent information, errors were communicated/cross-referenced with the field teams and corrected before finalizing the fieldwork. Geo-tagged photography was also adopted to ensure it complements our narrative report.

2.5 Field challenges

There were no notable limitations encountered during the TPM exercise. However, the TPM team went through some challenges in interviewing government officials who kept cancelling appointments. Additionally, some respondents did not share relevant documents that would form part of the project status verification. But the research team managed to secure all interviews despite repeated cancellations and lack of cooperation from ministry officials.

3.0 Findings

3.1 Federal Government of Somalia

Implementing partner: Ministry of Livestock, Forest and Range (MoLFR)

Indicator: Output I.1: Capacity Building and Regional Cooperation

- The directorate of Environment in the office of the prime minister signed the LOA on November 17th 2020. Since November, the directorate of environment has successfully coordinated LPG distribution in Jubaland (Kismayo) and Southwest State (Baidoa) where a total of 600 units of LPGs were delivered in each of the two locations. Project team admitted that they are slightly behind schedule due to the late signing of the LOA.
- So far the project engaged the following staffs: -
 - Program coordinator
 - Procurement officer
 - Finance officer
 - Policy advisor (a lawyer) was engaged and started working in December 2020
 - Two interns
- The Policy Advisor started reviewing the national charcoal policy that was presented to the cabinet for review and approval (Somali National Charcoal Policy)
- No coordination meeting, briefings, workshops were held in the last 6 months of July-December 2020.

3.2 Somaliland

Implementing partner: Ministry of Environment and Rural Development - MOERD

Indicator: Output I.1: Capacity Building and Regional Cooperation

- The PROSCAL project is in its third year of implementation in Somaliland – implemented for 6 months in 2018, 6 months in 2019, and 4 months in 2020. For 2020, the project commenced on 16th September, and ends on December 31st 2020. The allocated budget for PROSCAL was \$ 113,614, \$60,000 of which is used to subsidize the LPG cylinders. The subsidy involves a 62.5 percent reduction on market price from 32 dollars to 12 dollars.
- In Somaliland, the implementation of the PROSCAL was based on subsidizing of the LGP gas cylinders and were hence not offered free of charge - the LPG gas cylinders were offered at a price of \$12 for each unit.
- The project planned to distribute 2,910 LPG gas cylinders Hargeisa, Borama, Burco, Berbera, Las'anod, and Erigavo - 400 for Borama, 900 for Hargeisa, 600 for Burco and 200 each for Berbera, Las'anod, and Erigavo. However, this is not fixed and if a city needs or buys more, the ministry officials would redistribute accordingly. So far 1050 gas cylinders have being sold on a subsidized price.
- Also included in the distribution in 2020 were three health facilities, namely Borama, Burco, and Las'anod Hospitals where the project team renovated their cooking stations and fitted with LPG gas cookers, and solar to warm and boil water.

- The distribution task was assigned to HASS petroleum, the largest distributor of LPG gas in Somaliland. The ministry instructed HASS to include a disclaimer note indicating that the ministry and UNDP are not responsible for any negligence on the part of consumer when handling the cylinders.
- In 2019, 2000 cylinders were sold, and 2900 would be sold, therefore by the end of the current project, almost 4,900 households will have either moved, or partially moved away from using charcoal as a source of energy/fuel.
- The PROSCAL project created awareness about the environmental degradation and loss of livelihood through awareness messages from Radio Hargeisa. There are billboards that were also set up in previous project that also contributed to increased awareness on the need of becoming adapted to this alternative form of energy i.e. LPG.

 Beneficiary Traking -Disclaimer.docx	 LPG.pdf	 Summary sheet -Beneficiaries.xlsx
 Project _PROSCAL_completion report_2020		

3.3 Puntland State

Implementing Partner: Ministry of Environment, Agriculture and Climate Change

Indicator: Output I.1: Capacity Building and Regional Cooperation

- Through PROSCAL LOA, the ministry has hired technical staff comprising of a project coordinator and finance officer and energy expert and 1 female intern. The project coordinator serves as the focal point for PROSCAL project whose key functions involves coordinating with UNDP and donor agencies, providing update reports and progress attained through projects contributing to environmental management, and updating the DG on the milestones achieved. The role of the intern is to support the technical teams in compiling stakeholder's lists, supporting the technical teams in implementing project activities, while the energy expert conducts assessment on discovering alternative energy sources and efficient cooking methods.
- The ministry has received a consignment of LPG cylinders with cookers to support the vulnerable community members in Qardho, Bosaso, Badhan, Buran, Xingalol, Dahar, Galkaio and Garowe districts. The focal person reported receiving 1500 LPG gas cylinders, distributing 900 units to Qardho, Bosaso, Badhan, Badhan, Xingalol and Dahar. They further reported that remaining 600 LPGs with cookers would be distributed in Galkaio and Garowe in January, 2021.
- Coordination with different line ministry in supporting the reduction of prices on energy efficient sources and LPGs, dialogue meeting with different stakeholders, media engagement

and distribution of LPGs to vulnerable communities have been the key activities undertaken by the ministry to increase the adoption and use of LPGs by the community members to reduce the charcoal consumption at the local level. Three (3) functional water heating systems have been installed at the Orphanage college, Garowe general Hospital and Garowe main prison.

Number of briefings, workshops, coordination meetings held by the MoEACC

- The ministry held 1 training and 1 dialogue forum during Q3 and Q4 2020 - the 3-day training session was held in Garowe in November 2020. The objective of the trainings was to provide 12 IDP representatives from Qardho, Burtinle and Galkaio with the necessary skills required to make energy efficient cooking stoves. Additionally, the trained individuals were provided with the necessary equipment required in making the energy efficient cooking stoves. The training also aimed at increasing environmental awareness and project ownership for the beneficiaries in protecting and conserving the environment. The production of locally made cheap stoves and adoption of the efficient stoves at the local communities will contribute to the reduction of charcoal use and reduce deforestation rates in the long run.
- Public private partnership (PPP) dialogue on shifting of low-income families from charcoal/wood to alternative cooking energies with LPG companies, efficient cooking stove producers, energy consumers and MoEACC to discuss the shift of low-income families from charcoal / wood to clean energy was held. A total of 32 participants (21 male, 11 female) attended the dialogue forum representing Puntland Energy Development Agency, Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Commerce and Industries, Ministry of Environment, Agriculture and Climate Change, Garowe Municipality and Private Institutions such as SECCCO, WIRES, NECSOM, SAHAL GAS, SAFI GAS, GOLIS, SIDRA, East Africa university, hotels/ big restaurants (New-rays, Gobsoor, Same and Nabad & Caano), Women groups and charcoal traders.
- The outcome of the dialogue forum was creating increased awareness on environmental degradation and loss of livelihoods due to charcoal trade.
- Three (3) cooperatives were established through training of 12 IDPs representatives from 3 IDP camps. Following the trainings, the representatives were provided with equipment required to make the efficient cooking stoves. No grants were provided to set up their business within the targeted regions. Additionally, the trained individuals were only informed to reduce the prices of the stoves to make it accessible to the local communities and not trained on the percentages and amounts to sell the stoves made.
- As a result long term jobs were created for the 12 persons trained as they were equipped with the materials to produce the stoves - the sustainability of the jobs created will be dependent on the production and marketing of the teams involved.

 <p>Annex 1A Training and provision of esse</p>	 <p>Annex 2A Assessment and Selection Repor</p>	 <p>Annex 2B LPG distribution report.doc</p>
--	--	---

		
<p>Final PROSCAL Report - 2020.docx</p>		

3.4 Jubaland State

Implementing Partner: Ministry of Environment & Tourism

Indicator: Output I.1: Capacity Building and Regional Cooperation

- For PROSCAL project, Jubaland’s ministry of environment and tourism did not sign any agreement or LOA with UNDP, but implementation of the project is spearheaded by the Ministry of Livestock, Forest and Rangelands (MOLFR) of the Federal Government of Somalia. Ministry officials in Jubaland indicated that they expected the line ministry at FGS level to decentralize implementation of the PROSCAL but that did not bear any fruits.
- As at the TPM visit in December 2020 the Ministry of Livestock, Forest and Rangelands (MOLFR) of the FGS and UNDP officials have successfully delivered 600 units LPG gas cylinders. Ministry of Environment and Tourism staff reported that no other activity or component was delivered at Jubaland State in as far as the PROSCAL project is concerned. However, they furthered that the ministry of environment and tourism of Jubaland state officials attended the international conference of charcoal in Mogadishu on 7th and 8th may 2018 which was organized by the federal government of Somalia.
- Kismayo Gas Company was awarded the contract of distributing the 600 gas cylinders and at the TPM visit 405 cylinders were distributed and distribution was on-going.



LPG photos.docx

3.5 Hirshabelle State

Implementing Partner: Ministry of Environment & Rural Development

Indicator: Output I.1: Capacity Building and Regional Cooperation

- Implementation of the PROSCAL project in Hirshabelle State involves only two key activities: the distribution of 600 gas cookers 300 in Jowhar and 300 in Beledweyne and purchase and planting of 1000 trees in Jowhar town. The line ministry has not conducted any other activities in the last 6 months (July –December 2020).

3.6 Southwest State

Implementing partner: Ministry of Environment, Wildlife & Tourism

Indicator: Output 1.1: Capacity Building and Regional Cooperation

- The minister for Environment and Wildlife Hon. Ali Issack stated that the ministry has not done any concrete activities for PROSCAL project, save for the distribution of 600 LPG gas cylinders that were handed over to the ministry on 29-12-2020 in Baidoa.
- Ministry officials explained that the aim of the gas cylinders is to reduce charcoal trade and support alternative livelihoods and empower women who are on the charcoal business and to set up alternative energy businesses in liquefied petroleum and solar energy to minimise charcoal use, and build up opportunities to more alternative livelihoods.

4.0 Recommendations

1. There is need for enhanced communication between the UNDP country office and the various partners implementing the project.
2. The PROSCAL project was limited to distribution of LPG gas cylinders during Q3/Q4 of 2020, therefore there is need to continue delivering complementary activities such as creation of awareness and sensitization on this new product with the aim of promoting the use of such alternative energy and encourage people to move from charcoal fuel. And creation of alternative charcoal, briquettes from dry leaves etc.
3. There is need to replicate distribution of subsidized LPG cylinder which is currently limited to Somaliland and Puntland

5.0 Annexes

Data collection tool



TPM Questions for
PROSCAL_Q3 and Q4.doc